

Quotation without Quotation Marks

Word quotations, mixed quotations, and free quotations have in common that their occurrence in modern novels, academic articles and newspaper reports is in the first place signaled by the use of quotation marks; e.g.: 'Plato' has five letters; Cameron stressed that the deficit would not be cut 'in a way that hurts those that we most need to help' (*Guardian*, 7-6-2010); He looked straight at her. 'I will definitely come back tomorrow' (Semino & Short 2004: 10). On the whole, ancient Greek readers did not have this aid at their disposal (but cf. Rijksbaron 2007), despite the habit of many modern editors to insert quotation marks into our texts.

In Greek literature from Homer to Herodotus, these three forms of quotation are very rare and the extent of quoted material is usually overtly signalled by introductory and capping formulas. The same cannot be said of later classical authors, notably the orators, Xenophon, Plato and (in some places) Thucydides. My paper will briefly explore the historical circumstances that gave rise to the more frequent use of these types of quotation. I will also adduce evidence that shows that ancient readers were at times confused about the extent of quotations. I will then continue to set out the extent of the phenomena under consideration and the way ancient readers may have recognised them without the aid of quotation marks from a pragmatic perspective, leaving possible formalisations to others. My discussion will include:

The use of ὅτι 'that' as 'quotation marks' (Kühner & Gerth 1898-1904: 2.366-7), most instances of which are best interpreted as mixed quotations in which the conjunction has its proper semantic value (although there are a few counterexamples), as are *all* instances of 'colon'-ὥς 'that/how'. This interpretation is especially welcome in the case of the latter conjunction, because its semantic value can be demonstrated to be incompatible with quotation.

Disambiguation between quoted and non-quoted material in 'indirect' speech. Among the indexicals, only those referring to person can be regarded as decisive disambiguators; those of place and time behave much more irregularly, even in indirect speech (a phenomenon with parallels in other languages; cf. Li 1986). It is shown that this leaves many ambiguous instances which can only be disambiguated on the basis of other clues, such as 'intonation' (as indicated by particles) and broader inferential assumptions about the original or reporting speech situation. I suggest a number of places in which modern editors may wish to insert quotation marks. I also suggest that 'non-constituent' quotation (Maier 2008) is a step too far for Greek authors and its use may well be enabled by the existence of quotation marks in our culture.

The use of the definite article to mark the difference between 'mention' and 'use' on the basis of Bakker's (2009) analysis of the Greek article, which seems to confirm Geurts & Maier's (2005) hypothesis that quotation is context dependent in a presuppositional way.

Literature mentioned in the abstract:

BAKKER, S. J. (2009). *The Noun Phrase in Ancient Greek: a functional analysis of the order and articulation of NP constituents in Herodotus* (Leiden).

KÜHNER, R. & B. GERTH (1898-1904). *Ausführliche Grammatik der griechischen Sprache. Zweiter Teil: Satzlehre. 2 Voll.* (Hannover).

LI, C. N. (1986). 'Direct Speech and Indirect Speech: a functional study', in: F. COULMAS (ed.). *Direct and Indirect Speech* (Berlin), 29-45.

GEURTS, B. & E. MAIER (2005). 'Quotation in context', in P. de Brabanter (ed.). *Hybrid Quotations=Belgian Journal of Linguistics* 17: 109-28.

MAIER, E. (2008). 'Breaking quotations', in K. Satoh, A. Inokuchi, K. Nagao, and T. Kawamura, (eds). *New Frontiers in Artificial Intelligence* (Berlin/Heidelberg), 187-200.

RIJKSBARON, A. (2007). *Plato. Ion or on the Iliad*. Edited with introduction and commentary (Leiden).

SEMINO, E. & M. SHORT (2004). *Corpus Stylistics: speech, writing and thought presentation in a corpus of English writing* (London).